

Will Participation in a Music Pullout Program Bring Down My Child's Grades?

Research says no.

Groff(1963) was the pioneer in studying the effects of music pullout programs on academic achievement. His study determined that participating instrumental music students did not differ in total academic achievement from non-participating students despite absence from class.

Freidman (1960) studied the effect of instrumental students missing regular classroom instruction in reading and mathematics. The researcher concluded that the loss of regular classroom time did not hinder achievement on the Stanford Achievement test. In fact, a significant difference in reading scores was observed, favoring instrumental musicians.

Kvet(1985) compared reading, language, and math achievement of sixth graders and found "no significant difference in achievement between students who are excused from regular classroom activities for the study of instrumental music and students not studying instrumental music." (Kvet, p.45)

Circle(1983), music supervisor of the Shawnee Mission School District, determined that test scores of the instrumental students were higher in both math and in reading. After comparing scores of participants and non-participants on the Iowa Test of Basic Skills, Circle believes that participation in the music program increases students' achievement.

Holmes(1989) conducted a three-year comparison study of fifth grade participants' and non-participants' scores on the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills. Holmes found that music students continually surpassed their non-participant peers in academic achievement.

Dreyden(1992) studied fifth grade students' achievement on the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills in Kansas. When comparing students involved in a music pullout program to students not involved in the music pullout program, the results showed that "excusing elementary students from regular classroom activities does not negatively affect achievement in math or reading." (Dreyden, p. 72)

Wallick (1995) compared Ohio Proficiency Test Results of fourth graders participating in a string pullout program to those of matched ability who were not participating in the music pullout program. The results favored string students' achievement in reading and in citizenship and there was no significant difference between the two groups in writing or math sections.

Akin, Jeane. 1987. *A Study of Evidence That Music Education is a Positive Factor in K-8 Student Academic Achievement*. Available: <http://geocities.com/Athens/2405/pullouts.html> [1999, July 7]

Circle, David. 1989. *Pulling Your Child for Music Lessons Does Not Hurt Grades*. Available: <http://geocities.com/Athens/2405/pullouts.html> [1999, July 7]

Davis, Holly S. *Effects of Absence and Cognitive Skills Index on Various Achievement Indicators. A Study of ISTEP Scores, Discrepancies, and School-Based Math and English Tests of 1997-1998 Seventh Grade Students at Sarah Scott Middle School, Terre Haute, Indiana*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Services No. ED 423 302).

Dryden, Susannah. 1992. *The Impact of Instrumental Music Instruction on the Academic Achievement of Fifth Grade Students*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Services No. ED 368 634).

Friedman, B. 1960. *An Evaluation of the Achievement in Reading and Arithmetic of Pupils in Elementary School Instrumental Music Classes*. Dissertation Abstracts International.

Gillespie, Robert. 1992, Spring. *The Elementary Pull-Out Crisis: Using Research Effectively*. American String Teachers Journal. Available: <http://www.menc.org/publications/articles/academic/asta.htm> [1999, July 7]

Holmes, David Monroe. 1997. *An Examination of Fifth Grade Instrumental Music Programs and Their Relationships With Music and Academic Achievement (Band)*. Dissertation from University of Washington.

Kestrom, Joyce M. *The Unstoppable Power of Music: Its Role in the Curriculum and Its Effect on Academic Achievement*. NASSP Bulletin, April 1998, pp. 34-43.

Kvet, Edward J. *Excusing Elementary School Students from Regular Classroom Activities for the Study of Instrumental Music: The Effects on Sixth Grade Reading, Language, and Mathematics Achievement*. Journal of Research in Music Education, Spring 1985, pp. 45-54.

Rauscher, Frances, et al. 1995, May-June. *Does Music Make You Smarter?* PTA Today, pp. 8-9.

Wallick, Michael. 1995. *A Comparison Study of the Ohio Proficiency Test Results Between Fourth-Grade Spring Pullout Students and Those of Matched Ability*. Available: <http://www.menc.org/publications/articles/academic/wallick.htm> [1999, July 7]

Zanutto, Daniel Raymond. 1997. *The Effects of Instrumental Music Instruction on Academic Achievement (High School Students)*. Dissertation from University of California-Davis.